



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 30, 2004

Ms. Lois Cochran
Records Coordinator
City of Cleburne
P.O. Box 677
Cleburne, Texas 76033-0677

OR2004-10970

Dear Ms. Cochran:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 216085.

The City of Cleburne (the "city") received a request for three specific offense reports. You state that you have provided the requestor with a portion of the requested information. You claim, however, that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that Exhibit 4 pertains to a case that is still pending. Thus, we agree that the release of Exhibit 4 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Therefore, we agree that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to this information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. You assert that Exhibit 2 pertains to a case that concluded in a final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we agree that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to this information.

We note, however, that information normally found on the front page of an incident report is generally considered public. *See generally* Gov't Code § 552.108(c); *Houston Chronicle*, 531 S.W.2d at 186-188; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976). Thus, you must release the types of information that are considered to be front page incident report information from Exhibits 2 and 4, even if this information is not actually located on the front page of the incident reports. Although sections 552.108(a)(1) and (a)(2) authorize you to withhold the remaining information in Exhibits 2 and 4 from disclosure, you may choose to release all or part of the information at issue that is not otherwise confidential by law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007.

We also understand you to generally raise section 552.108 for Exhibit 3. You state that pursuant to section 552.108(c) you have made the arrest warrant, arrest report, and front page information in Exhibit 3 available to the requestor. However, you have not raised or argued either section 552.108(a)(1) or 552.108(a)(2) for the information in Exhibit 3. Thus, the city has failed to demonstrate that the release of Exhibit 3 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime or that this information pertains to a case that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706. Therefore, the city may not withhold Exhibit 3 under section 552.108.

We note, however, that Exhibit 3 contains a social security number, which may be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ A social security number or "related record" may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security number in the submitted information is confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the

¹ Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes.

Government Code imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing the social security number information, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the city pursuant to any provision of law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Finally, Exhibit 3 also contains driver's license numbers that are excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts information relating to a Texas motor vehicle driver's license and information relating to a Texas motor vehicle title or registration. Gov't Code § 552.130. We have marked the driver's license numbers in Exhibit 3 the city must withhold under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of basic information that must be released, the city may withhold Exhibits 2 and 4 under section 552.108 of the Government Code. The social security number in Exhibit 3 may be confidential under federal law, and the city must withhold the driver's license information we have marked in Exhibit 3 under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the

² We note that the submitted information also includes the requestor's social security number and driver's license number. In accordance with section 552.023 the requestor in this instance has a special right of access to personal information that would be excepted from disclosure under provisions designed to protect her privacy. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 481 (1987). However, if the city receives another request for this particular information from a different requestor, the city should again seek a decision from this office.

governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Lauren E. Kleine
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LEK/jev

Ref: ID# 216085

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Sheree Cross
511 East Oak Dale
Keene, Texas 76098
(w/o enclosures)